

I have considered manuscript CK11023, “First nonzero measurement of a nuclear electric dipole moment”, by G. Prézeau. The Chief Editor asked me to weigh in on whether this manuscript should be reviewed by PRC referees.

The manuscript is flawed and technically unsound. Furthermore,

- There is no charge distribution in a point like nucleus. To measure a nuclear EDM requires, at least, a charge distribution. Thus, there is no connection from the measurements to a nuclear EDM.
- Classical descriptions of currents in a bulk material, even if superconducting, are not relevant to measurement of an EDM of a nucleus. The sample being probed is bulk material. The graphs presented appear to be measurements of bulk material properties.
- There is no comprehensive or proper error analysis (both statistical and systematic).

Based on these observations, I believe PRC should return the manuscript to the author without review.

Sincerely,

David J. Dean, PhD  
Member, Physical Review C Editorial Board